

03/29/2018

JULIA C. DUDLEY, CLERK
BY: s/ F. COLEMAN
DEPUTY CLERK

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA
LYNCHBURG DIVISION

CARL D. GRAY,

Plaintiff,

v.

CAROLYN COLVIN, Acting Commissioner of
Social Security

Defendant.

CASE NO. 6:16-cv-00009

ORDER

Judge Norman K. Moon

Previously, I entered an order (“Dismissal Order”) denying Plaintiff’s motion for summary judgment, granting the Commissioner’s motion, and overruling Plaintiff’s objections to a Report and Recommendation by Magistrate Judge Robert S. Ballou. (Dkt. 24). I later *sua sponte* vacated the Dismissal Order and remanded to Judge Ballou for a supplemental report and recommendation (“supplemental R&R”) to consider the Fourth Circuit’s then-recent, “plausibly relevant” decision in *Brown v. Commissioner*, No. 16-1578. (Dkt. 25). After supplemental briefing, Judge Ballou entered his supplemental R&R, reasoning that *Brown*—as a “highly fact-specific” decision that “not change the law”—did not alter the result in this case. (Dkt. 30). Plaintiff timely objected. (Dkt. 31). After undertaking a *de novo* review of those portions of the R&R to which objections were made, 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1)(B); *Farmer v. McBride*, 177 F. App’x 327, 330 (4th Cir. 2006), I agree with Judge Ballou’s reasoning and conclusions. Accordingly, Plaintiff’s original and supplemental objections are **OVERRULED**. I hereby **ADOPT** in full Judge Ballou’s original and supplemental R&Rs. (Dkt. 21, 30). The Commissioner’s Motion for Summary Judgment (dkt. 16) is **GRANTED**, Plaintiff’s Motion for

Summary Judgment (dkt. 14) is **DENIED**, and this case is **DISMISSED** from the active docket of the Court.

Entered this 29th day of March, 2018.



NORMAN K. MOON
SENIOR UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE